# PENNSYLVANIA LIQUOR CONTROL BOARD

# **MEETING MINUTES**

# WEDNESDAY, APRIL 5, 2017 NORTHWEST OFFICE BUILDING, CONFERENCE ROOM 117, HARRISBURG, PA

Tim Holden, Chairman Mike Negra, Board Member Michael Newsome, Board Member Charlie Mooney, Executive Director John Stark, Board Secretary Office of Chief Counsel
Bureau of Licensing
Bureau of Human Resources
Bureau of Accounting & Purchasing

Office of Retail Operations
Bureau of Product Selection
Financial Report
Other Issues

# **PUBLIC MEETING – 11:00 A.M**

Board Secretary John K. Stark indicated that a quorum of the Board was present and Chairman Holden called the meeting to order.

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

OLD BUSINESS......Secretary Stark

A. Motion to approve the previous Board Meeting Minutes of the March 22, 2017 meeting.

Motion Made: Board Member Negra
Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously approved (3-0 vote) previous Board Minutes.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEMS

There was no public comment on the printed agenda items.

# **NEW BUSINESS**

(1) Oakland Volunteer Fire Company
1741 Bedford Street
Johnstown, PA 15902-3425
Special Occasion Permit No. SO-30199

LID 80693 Citation No. 16-1034 Appeal of Adjudication and Order of Administrative Law Judge Board Member Negra asked Rod Diaz, Chief Counsel, to explain this matter.

Mr. Diaz explained that the Oakland Volunteer Fire Company ("OVFC") held a Special Occasion Permit ("SOP") and was cited for providing/selling alcohol to a minor in violation of the Liquor Code. OVFC submitted a waiver admitting to the violation and waiving its right to a hearing. However, the Administrative Law Judge ("ALJ") rejected the waiver and *sua sponte* dismissed the citation because he believed that he lacked jurisdiction over the matter. The ALJ opined that SOP holders are not subject to citations under section 471 of the Liquor Code, 47 P.S. § 4-471.

Mr. Diaz indicated that the provisions of the Liquor Code authorizing the PLCB to issue SOPs specifically allow the PLCB to consider the operational history of applicants for SOPs, and the Supreme Court has said that the most important thing to consider when evaluating "operational history" is "citation history." Thus, the ALJ erred in his interpretation. Mr. Diaz stated that if SOP holders are not subject to citation under section 471, the alternative would be for the police to issue criminal citations in cases involving SOP holders. Accordingly, the Office of Chief Counsel recommended that the ALJ's decision be reversed and that the matter be remanded for further proceedings.

Board Member Negra expressed concern that the ALJ's decision, if affirmed, could result in there being no repercussions for SOP holders selling alcohol to minors, which would effectively allow them to sell alcohol to persons of any age.

In response, Mr. Diaz indicated that, under the ALJ's interpretation, SOP holders would be treated differently than any other licensee in terms of sales to minors.

Motion Made: Board Member Negra Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Reverse ALJ and Remand the Matter for

Further Proceedings.

### (2) Club 530, Inc.

526 Lackawanna Avenue Scranton, Pennsylvania 18503-2008 Restaurant Liquor License No. R-13112 LID 59025 Docket No. 855 C.D. 2016 (Commonwealth Court) Petition for Allowance of Appeal to Supreme Court.

Board Member Negra asked Rod Diaz, Chief Counsel, to explain this matter.

Mr. Diaz explained that the Licensee tried to take its license out of safekeeping, but was unsuccessful in doing so because of lacking a valid health permit and a conflict of interest issue. The issues were not resolved prior to the expiration of the safekeeping period, and the license was revoked by operation of law.

The Licensee subsequently appealed to the Court of Common Pleas of Lackawanna County ("trial court"), where the case hung in limbo for several years. The trial court ultimately reversed the revocation and reinstated the license. The trial court also refused to retroactively impose any safekeeping fees for the time period which had lapsed since the expiration of the safekeeping period, because the matter was being litigated.

The PLCB pursued an appeal with the Commonwealth Court, which ultimately affirmed the trial court. The Commonwealth Court further ordered the Licensee to either apply to extend the safekeeping period or apply for reissuance of the license from safekeeping.

Mr. Diaz further explained that appeals to the Supreme Court are not automatic and that it seems unlikely that the Supreme Court would be willing to allow an appeal in this matter. Accordingly, the Office of Chief Counsel recommended that no petition for allowance of appeal be pursued.

Motion Made: Board Member Negra Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) – Do not file Petition for Allowance of

Appeal to Supreme Court.

From the Bureau of Licensing ...... Tisha Albert, Director of Regulatory Affairs

Barbara Peifer, Director, Bureau of Licensing

(1) Broad Street Properties & Ventures, LLC t/a Old Spitfire Grill

Appointment of Manager – Hotel

H-3001 (LID No. 69583) Case No. 16-9106 1505-1517 Broad Street South Greensburg, Westmoreland County

Motion Made: Board Member Negra
Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Approve Appointment of Manager.

(2) Domusimplicis, LLC

t/a iPasta

EDR-42 (LID No. 72618) Case No. 16-9018

134 East Gay Street

West Chester, Chester County

New – Economic Development

Restaurant

**HOLD - 1/18/17 SESSION** 

Motion Made: Board Member Negra
Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Refuse Application for New

Economic Development Restaurant Liquor License.

(3) M. K. Hahn, Inc. t/a Munchies Dining

R-14650 (LID No. 82417) Case No. 16-9102

23 Main Street

Eldred, McKean County

"Intermunicipal" Double
Transfer & Request for an
Interior Connection with
Another Business – Restaurant

Extension of License – Restaurant

•

**Motion Made:** 

Board Member Negra

**Seconded:** 

**Board Decision:** Hold by Board Member Negra for a Conditional Licensing Agreement.

(4) Market Street Sports Bar, Inc.

t/a The Works Tavern & Kitchen

R-11633 (LID No. 54911) Case No. 17-9010

50 & 42 Market Street

Bangor, Northampton County

**Motion Made:** 

Board Member Negra

**Seconded:** 

**Board Decision:** Hold by Board Member Negra for an Amended Conditional Licensing

Agreement.

(5) Taphouse Bar & Grill, Inc.

R-3058 (LID No. 65573)

23 Chestnut Street

Sharon, Mercer County Citation No. 13-0972

Motion Made: Board Member Negra
Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Accept and Approve Stipulation.

Stipulation – Restaurant

HOLD - 3/8/17 SESSION

(6) Toss'd Food Service, LLC

R-3058 (LID No. 81922) Case No. 16-9098

489 South Hermitage Road

Hermitage, Mercer County

"Intermunicipal" Double Transfer – Restaurant

HOLD - 3/8/17 SESSION

Double Transfer – Restaurant

Motion Made: Board Member Negra Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Approve Transfer.

(7) West Bank Hospitality, Inc.

R-455 (LID No. 73326) Case No. 16-9101

4629-31 Baltimore Avenue

Philadelphia, Philadelphia County

**Motion Made:** 

Board Member Negra

**Seconded:** 

**Board Decision:** Hold by Board Member Negra for a Conditional Licensing Agreement.

(8) Jones' Corner, Inc.

Conditional Licensing Agreement Renewal – District 2

R-15789 (LID No. 25382) Case No. 16-9042

428 Harrisburg Street

Swatara Township

Steelton, Dauphin County

HOLD – 2/1/17 SESSION

Motion Made: Board Member Negra Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Approve Renewal with New

Conditional Licensing Agreement.

(9) O.D.'s Place, Inc.

Renewal – District 2

E-2579 (LID No. 5574) Case No. 16-9044

1500 Market Street

HOLD – 2/1/17 SESSION

Harrisburg, Dauphin County

Motion Made: Board Member Negra
Seconded: Board Member Newsome

Chairman Holden asked if there was anyone present for the Applicant, but

there was no response.

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Refuse Renewal.

(10) O.D.'s Plantation, Inc.

Renewal – District 2

R-17606 (LID No. 18794) Case No. 16-9043

1601 Sycamore Street

HOLD – 2/1/17 SESSION

Harrisburg, Dauphin County

Motion Made: Board Member Negra Seconded: Board Member Newsome

Chairman Holden asked if there was anyone present for the Applicant, but

there was no response.

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Refuse Renewal.

(11) SDC2014 LLC

New Tavern Gaming License

H-3186 (LID No. 70933) 547 Philadelphia Street Indiana, Indiana County

Motion Made: Board Member Negra Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Approve New Tavern Gaming

License.

Following the vote on this matter, Chairman Holden asked Tisha Albert, Director of Regulatory Affairs, for an update on the total number of Tavern Gaming Licenses that have been approved by the Board. Ms. Albert indicated that, with the license that was just approved, a total of 56 Tavern Gaming Licenses have now been approved. Ms. Albert also

noted that there are currently two applications pending.

From the Bureau of Human Resources ....... Jason Lutcavage, Director of Administration

Jennifer Haas, Director, Bureau of Human Resources

### Personnel Actions

- (1) Frank Colantuono Removal
- (2) Lorenzo Coleman Affirm Removal
- (3) Eileen Donohue Affirm Removal
- (4) Angela Gallman Removal
- (5) Nicholas Mauro Rescind Board Action of 3/8/17

- (6) Denise McKinney Removal
- (7) Chester Medley Removal
- (8) Breonia Robinson Affirm Removal
- (9) Bernadette Sap Removal

Motion Made: Board Member Negra Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Approve all Personnel Actions.

From the Bureau of Accounting & Purchasing .......Oren Bachman, Director of Finance
Koppolu Ravindraraj, Director, Bureau of Accounting & Purchasing

(1) **AppWorx and One Automation Software Support** – Provide AppWorx and One Automation software support which is used for job scheduling for the majority of the PLCB's batch processing of Oracle and other applications, both in production and lower environments.

Procured via as per Part I, Chapter 07 Thresholds and Delegations of the Procurement Handbook, agencies are authorized to procure software license maintenance agreements on a no-bid basis – VENDOR: Automic Software Inc. – TERM: One (1) year – \$95,015.00 estimated cost.

(2) **Email Service** – Provide Listrak software service to send up to 24,000,000 emails to licensees and customers.

Procured via DGS Statewide Contract #4400007199 – VENDOR: Dell – TERM: One (1) year – \$91,680.00 estimated cost.

(3) Legal Services – Provide legal services for litigation case pending in Board of Claims.

Procured via Sole Source – VENDOR: Pillar+Aught LLC – TERM: Two (2) years – \$350,000.00 estimated cost.

Motion Made: Board Member Negra Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Approve all Purchasing and Contracting

Actions.

- 1. #9203 2 Ohio River Boulevard, Leetsdale Amendment
- 2. #0101 1275 York Road, Gettysburg New Lease / Rebrand
- 3. #51XX 236-400 West Allegheny Avenue, Philadelphia New Store / Relocation (to replace #5142)
- 4. #0923 864 East Street Road, Warminster Closing
- 5. #2318 2709 West 9<sup>th</sup> Street, Chester Closing

Board Member Negra asked Carl Jolly, Director of Retail Operations, whether the store closings would result in the loss of any jobs.

Mr. Jolly responded by indicating that the store closings would not result in the loss of any jobs. He explained that when stores are closed, the employees assigned to those stores are reallocated to other stores.

Motion Made: Board Member Negra Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Approve all Retail Operations Actions.

# 1. Regular New Items Accepted

BRAND NAME AND SIZE	REASON
Bacardi USA Inc	
Bacardi Classic Cocktails Rum Punch 1.75 L	3
Bacardi Gold Rum 200 ML	3
Cazadores Blanco Tequila 1.75 L	3
Grey Goose L'Orange Vodka 375 ML	3
Palm Bay International	10
Bribon Tequila Blanco 750 ML	10

# Southern Wine Spirits PA

RumChata Horchata Cream Liqueur Mini Chatas 375 ML

3

### RECOMMENDED ACTION: We recommend the Board approve this action

#### **New Items – Recommended Listings**

#### **Reason Codes**

- 1. Strong marketing support
- 2. High brand recognition
- 3. Line/Size extension of successful brand
- 4. Trade up opportunity
- 5. Growing category
- 6. Growing segment
- 7. National rollout
- 8. Niche item / Limited distribution
- 9. High dollar profit potential
- 10. Trade out

- 11. High quality for the value
- 12. Innovative product/flavor
- 13. High sales through other PLCB channels (Luxury, Online, SLO)
- 14. Underrepresented category/segment
- 15. Hole in selection consumer/store requests

# 2. Regular Recommended Delist Retail Reductions April 2017

# **BRAND NAME AND SIZE CODE McCormick Distilling Co** Platte Valley Fireshine 750 ML 9469

RECOMMENDED ACTION: We recommend the Board approve this action

# 3. Regular Recommended Delist Retail Reductions May 2017

BRAND NAME AND SIZE	CODE
C Jacquin ET CIE Inc	
Dream Catcher Irish Liqueur 750 ML	8844
Arrowhead Wine Cellars	
Arrowhead Buffalo Blush 1.5 L	7967
Arrowhead Wine Cellars Niagara 1.5 L	5785
Arrowhead Wine Cellars Red Fredonia 1.5 L	6883

# **William Grant Sons Inc**

Art In The Age Rhubarb Tea 750 ML Art In The Age Ginger Snap Liqueur 750 ML 4166

3383

EFFECTIVE DATES: The transference to closeout will become effective April 9, 2017

RECOMMENDED ACTION: We recommend the Board approve this action

Motion Made: Board Member Negra Seconded: Board Member Newsome

**Board Decision:** Unanimously agreed (3-0 vote) to Approve all Bureau of Product Selection /

Marketing Actions.

FINANCIAL REPORT ...... Michael J. Burns, Comptroller Operations, Office of Budget

None

# **OTHER ISSUES**

None

### CITIZEN COMMENT/BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None

#### **NEXT BOARD MEETING**

The next meeting of the PLCB will be a formal meeting on Wednesday, April 19, 2017 beginning at 11:00 A.M. Prior to the public meeting, there will be an Executive Session to discuss matters of personnel and to engage in non-deliberative informational discussions, some of which are regarding actions and matters which have been approved at previous public meetings.

# **ADJOURNMENT**

On a motion by Board Member Negra, seconded b	y Board Member Newsome, the meeting was adjourned.
The foregoing actions are hereby officially approv	ed.
	Chairman
	Member
	Member
ATTEST:	
Secretary	